

Supervisor Forbes called the meeting to order at 7:02pm.
A prayer was led by John Stack.
The pledge was led by Supervisor Forbes.

Roll Call:

Present: John Stack, Michael Clinesmith, Bob Forbes, Sam Tester, Bill Gray
Absent: None

Minutes:

Motion by Gray, seconded by Tester to approve the September 8, 2015 regular meeting minutes as written.

Vote 4-1, MOTION CARRIED

Reports:

MTA Training Report:

Stack went to a MTA sponsored Treasurer's Retreat. He mentioned that Vassar Township is doing well compared to other locations. One focus was on looking at Townships' Policy and Procedures, and how to address non-statutory duties, since a Township cannot assume a clerk, treasurer, trustee or supervisor will do these duties.

Treasurer's Report:

There were questions raised about a training class the Clerk had signed up for, and that online training classes should be available for the board.

Motion by Forbes, seconded by Tester to check with MTA to see if Tact in Communication seminars are available through web cast.

Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

Motion by Forbes, seconded by Tester to approve the payables with the exception of the Career Track check in the amount of \$21,449.88.

Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

A question was brought up about the delay in transferring the phone service from AT&T to Air Advantage. The delay is that Air Advantage is waiting for AT&T's permission to switch the numbers.

Trustee Report by Bill Gray and filed with the Clerk.

Forbes added he would like to meet with Fred Welsh and Kendall Woodruff on Friday to discuss the roadside corners.

Zoning Administrator's Report by Curtis Pennell, (~~remove~~) read by Forbes and filed with Clerk.

There was mention of a property used for recycling, and some discussion about its compliance with the ordinances and if the installation of a scale alters the grandfathering of the property

Assessor's Report by Debby Valentine, read by Forbes and filed with the Clerk.

Library Board Report by Onna Clinesmith

The Library has new hours. Tuesday through Friday the hours are 10am to 8pm. Saturday hours are 10am to 4pm. The Library has started charging for video rentals, but this is under review by the Library Board. The library is sponsoring a free bus to a pumpkin farm. October 20, there is a meet and great for

the new city manager and library director. Christian Dunham, the Library director is currently working on an article for the Township's newsletter.

Fire Run Report by Nancy Zuzula filed with the Clerk.

Clerk's Report:

Clerk Clinesmith requested his report be included in the minutes and are attached at the end.

Supervisor's Report:

Supervisor Forbes welcomed Justin Nitz, the new Township Sheriff's deputy.

The names of the people who helped on the Township Park work day on September 26, 2015 are Collin Fall, Gabe Fall, Steve Walker, Kyle Walker, Fred Welsh, Marshall Fabbro, Michael Clinesmith, Kyle Fall, Aleigh Fall, Tyler Fall, Chris Fall, Onna Clinesmith, Russ Fall, Peg Fall, Alex Bergman, Phil Nephew and Donald Clinesmith.

The Supervisor requested his report be included in the minutes and are attached at the end.

Communications:

MI Dept. of Licensing – alcohol license transfer:

The Clerk read the letter concerning the transfer of ownership of the liquor license for Colosky's Market.

eCities:

The Clerk mentioned an invitation to a luncheon in Dearborn from eCities concerning best practices for entrepreneurial communities. The Board showed no interest in the event.

Tuscola Township Master Plan:

The Clerk read a letter from the Tuscola Township Planning Commission regarding Master Plan distributed for review. There will be a public hearing on the master plan on December 9, 2015 at 6:30pm at the Tuscola Township Hall, 8561 Van Cleve Rd, Vassar, MI 48768.

Juniata Township Resolution of Support:

The Clerk read Juniata Township's resolution of support for the Township of Vassar's 2015-2019 Parks and Recreation Master Plan.

The Treasurer at this point brought up on the screen the MTA site on training classes, and there was some discussion on this.

Unfinished Business:

518 Forms – Unemployment Agency:

The Clerk stated he had contacted the attorneys and was still waiting for information from them.

Fire Runs:

Nancy Zuzula met with Forbes and wanted to ask about the Township's policies. There was a meeting with the fire chiefs from Vassar City to discuss the fire runs and incomplete reports. There was a suggestion to get maps on the wires in the Townships and mention that electric companies give a 90 day window for fire run billing. There was mention that the fire department is not allowed to ask a person's name, ask for a driver's license or call the police department for information. The Sheriff's department cannot run plates for billing. Zuzula suggested the Township's Ordinance be changed.

There was some discussion about the Township's fire run policy. There was a suggestion to contact Vassar City Manager. The Township's attorney was contacted and is working on developing a list of options for the Board, but they were not received yet.

Mileage Request:

Gray read his attorney report concerning his discussion with the Township's attorney. Tester was present when he made the call. As for the Harper House mileage request, the attorney raised the question if it was worth the cost of researching the situation regarding the mileage and that it was up to the Township Board on what to do. The Report is included with the Trustee's Report.

There was discussion about a mileage request to pay mileage to return printer cartridges to Staples in Saginaw and the costs involved.

Motion by Forbes for Bob to give up his mileage and pay the mileage for Nancy to travel to Staples.
Motion withdrawn.

Motion by Tester, seconded by Gray that the Township make a good faith gesture and pay Bob Forbes and Nancy Zuzula's mileage requests and that any further mileage requests come to the Township Board first before payment.

Vote 4-1, MOTION CARRIED.

New Business:

PC Appointments:

Motion by Forbes, seconded by Gray to appoint Kendall Woodruff to the Planning Commission with term ending October 2018.

Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

Motion by Forbes, seconded by Clinesmith to appoint Fred Welsh to the Planning Commission with term ending October 2018.

Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

ZBA Appointment:

Motion by Forbes, seconded by Gray that the Township accept Jerry Dutcher's resignation from the ZBA alternate position and appoint Jerry Dutcher to the ZBA with term ending October 2018.

Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

Sheriff's Contract:

RESOLUTION 23-2015: Approving Sheriff's Contract for 2016

WHEREAS, Vassar Township residents are in need of protection by the Tuscola County Sheriff Department. This contract will provide extra protection for all the residents.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Vassar Township Board of Trustees approve the Sheriff's Contract with Vassar Township for the year 2016.

The foregoing resolution offered by Board Member Bob Forbes and supported by Board Member Sam Tester.

Upon roll call vote, the following voted **"Aye" (5): Tester, Clinesmith, Forbes
Gray, Stack**

"Nay" (0): NONE

The Supervisor declared the resolution adopted.

Forbes stated that that was misleading, and he does not want misleading stuff put in the minutes, it is counterproductive.

Donald Clinesmith, 6630 Washburn Rd. made a statement to the Supervisor that you have been pretty critical the last five months, and that is why he records the meetings, that you have a problem treating with respect the Clerk. It all had to do with money. Nothing was wrong before the Clerk thought he deserved more money than you. He was probably right. His job requires a lot more time. And there isn't a Supervisor in the county that earns more than the Treasurer or Clerk. You thought the money he was getting was too much. But you go with the General Motors feeling that if everybody gets a raise, everybody gets the same. It is a union thing. If one board member would get \$12,000, they all could get \$12,000, but no more. If those guys do all the work, and they do; you take the responsibility of sitting in that seat, but you don't do the recording keeping, and don't do the money. One more thing, there are a lot of things you don't do right. You do some wonderful things. You worked for that lady all summer long. If you were a welfare person and thought it was a wonderful thing to do, you spent a lot of time working for her, and that's great. One thing you do need to do, like John said at the beginning of the meeting is Policies and Procedures Manual. And there you fill find how to respect your fellow people on the Board. You need to learn that. Donald Clinesmith requested his comments go in the minutes.

Forbes requested his response be included as well. He stated that he does respect Mike but he has turned 180 degrees since he did not get his raise. He had nothing to do with his raise, the people at the annual meeting decided what the raise was. There were proposals for \$15,000, \$30,000. I told Mike at the beginning they would not go along with that, and they didn't. So it's not me. But because he didn't get it a lot of things have been happening in the Township.

D. Clinesmith asked, "Name one!"

Forbes stated "withholding pay." That's one.

D. Clinesmith stated he didn't believe that ever happened. You guys on the Board there, think about it.

Sam Tester said "here's one," holding up a document. "We didn't get that." He stated that he talked with the attorney and he is being called on things that should be settled at the Township.

D. Clinesmith asked why the Board didn't say anything.

Tester said it wasn't brought here yet. It went to the attorney; then they called.

D. Clinesmith stated that he made a comment in the August meeting minutes that three of the Board members took out because John wasn't there. They took his wife's comments out. In the last two months the Supervisor put things in at the end of the meeting because he thinks his comments are worth more than anyone else's comments. He said he wanted words put into the minutes, the same thing he told the Clerk last month.

Forbes stated that "Yours were already in there."

D. Clinesmith stated "You took mine out in August.", that he didn't like what he said.

Forbes stated that they were crossed out.

D. Clinesmith stated it was illegal, but he did it. He said he has done it twice. If he does it a third time...

Tester asked if it was a threat.

D. Clinesmith stated no, but the next time it's going to court. If it's the third time, it's illegal.

Forbes stated "No it's not."

D. Clinesmith stated "Freedom of speech."

Ben Partridge asked about the second time, he only knew of one.

D. Clinesmith he was done. He was sorry, he was upset.

Forbes read from a section from the letter from the attorney stating it was good practice not to include individual comments in the minutes. The corrections shall occur at the next meeting and shall show the individual entry and corrections. Forbes stated that what he did, he didn't take away his freedom of speech. But he did take confusing things where "you guys said these guys got a 40% raise and we only got 14."

D. Clinesmith stated that was another thing that he wanted to mention, that the Supervisor was the only one that kept bringing up the money, over and over and kept mentioning the Clerk's name. He was sorry he felt that way, but the Supervisor was the one causing the problem on the Board. Stop bringing the money up. It was passed a long time ago.

Forbes stated that D. Clinesmith made a statement that helpless woman; this is a Vietnam veteran that's been living in poverty.

D. Clinesmith stated he didn't talk about that lady at all.

Forbes stated he did just a few minutes ago.

D. Clinesmith asked what he said, then that he said that the Supervisor took that as his job. It was great that he did it. D. Clinesmith didn't agree with it, and the Supervisor did it on Township time.

Forbes stated he did it on his own time.

D. Clinesmith asked what he did at the hours at the hall, he worked on that.

Forbes stated that he didn't.

Michael Clinesmith stated, "The Vassar Township Board is the deliberative and legislative body of Vassar Township, therefore it is the duty of the Board to have thorough discussion of issues related to the Township, including the pay of elected officials, appointed officials, and other people who are serving the Township. The Supervisor's position may be that it is confusing to readers to state that an increase of Trustee from \$128 to \$178 per month is a 40% raise, and that the pay for the lawnmower from \$40 to \$60 per mowing is a 50% raise; I'll let the residents of the Township make the decision on that. I give 100% to serve the residents of Vassar Township as Clerk. The Supervisor in the past has talked about working as a time. I'm uncertain how the last two Supervisor reports accusing the Clerk of misleading voters achieves that objective. Maybe the Supervisor should get back to writing reports on what he has done for the Township?"

Forbes stated that one time he dialed a phone, and picked up a pencil and put it in his report.

D. Clinesmith stated that it was those kinds of comments that made him lose respect; that he didn't need to say that. He made those kinds of comments when he worked at General Motors because he had to make his guy look good. But it is not needed at the Board. He's working with nice people, don't treat them like that.

Sally Hartung asked what are you saying about General Motors?

Orville Hartung said he had a problem with him mentioning General Motors like that. That 40% of the people in the Township were General Motors workers and were paying the taxes. He asked if D. Clinesmith was saying that they had a mindset.

D. Clinesmith stated that was what the union was supposed to do. But the Supervisor doesn't need to do it here.

Tester stated that isn't what the union does, that he was in management.

D. Clinesmith stated he knew that, and that he was on the Board because Bob asked him.

Ben Partridge stated that he liked when the Board had a discussion over a vote, and then vote. That brought up a question about the meeting minutes tonight. There were four yesses and one no, why did that person vote no to the minutes he wrote?

Forbes stated that startled him.

Partridge said that he was confused and the Township was owed an explanation. He was used to the minutes showing what we want them to show and not the answer. He wanted his comments in the minutes if he was going to show the answer. If he wasn't going to show the answer...

Michael Clinesmith asked if he was being asked why he voted no on the minutes.

Partridge said that the Clerk presented the minutes, "Your minutes." They were approved the way he wrote them. He voted "no" with no reason.

M. Clinesmith asked if he was going to be given time to give an explanation. He said that he prepared the minutes, the reason he voted "No" was that the Supervisor requested his report be put in the minutes, and the Supervisor's report didn't say what he was doing, but that the Clerk was misleading voters. The meeting before, the Supervisor specifically asked that the Clerk's comments be stricken from the minutes. That was the big fight from before. The previous month he said he wanted the statement taken out of the minutes, and in the report he talked about working as a team, and this month he put in his report about misleading voters and... That he wanted to put those things in the minutes.

Partridge stated, that led him to ask that "You're the Clerk, don't listen to him." Write your minutes, they are supposed to be the way you took the meeting. You should not be taking his advice and then vote no on the minutes you present to the meeting. He can then ask why you didn't put it in the minutes and you can have discussion about why you did this or that. But I don't think you're doing your job if you writing the minutes the way everybody else tells you to write.

M. Clinesmith stated the Supervisor has the ability to request things be put in the minutes.

Partridge stated that everybody has the right to request things be put in the minutes, check the law. And that the Clerk is the sole authority on the submitted minutes. Then they have to vote for or against you. "You can write anything you want in those minutes."

Fred Welsh requested to check with the Michigan Township Association on what they told him about the minutes when he went to his training, that the public comments do not have to be entered in any portion in the minutes of a meeting. It is the minutes of the official board. He puts those public comments in the Planning Commission Minutes. But the MTA trains that public comments do not at all have to go in the minutes.

Janice Zawol stated when she was secretary for the Planning Commission years ago it was the same thing. The public comments did not have to go in, but she put them in as a courtesy.

Motion by Tester, seconded by Gray to adjourn.
Vote 5-0, MOTION CARRIED.

Meeting Adjourned at 9:50pm.

Minutes prepared by Clerk Clinesmith.

Vassar Township Clerk

Vassar Township Supervisor

Clerk's Report for October 2015

Meeting notices, minutes, web site & FB updates, sort mail, check emails, enter and print checks, agenda, meeting packets, EFTPS payment

Contacted BS & A several times about software, appointment setup, faxed contract-Contacted Vicky Sherry about Recreation plan, emailed plan info-Contacted Air Advantage several times, met with and signed transfer form-Contacted county clerk about county proposal, clerk meeting-Contacted Harper Alarm about phone/alarm system-Contacted Cyberlink about Dropbox setup-Contacted TrueValue about chipper-Contacted attorney about 518 forms, fire run

Updated Vassar Township info for Election Official Directory

Installed Avast antivirus on outer computer

Travelled to Lansing for Election Forms committee 9/22/2015. Did not charge for mileage

Travelled to Caro for election equipment demos (one time cancelled on short notice)

Updated QVF, sent out cancellation notices

Picked up stamps at post office

General Ordinance put out for public, scanned and sent to Drew Stark

Sorted files in office

Township audit 10/1/2015

FOIA request from American Transparency on employees

Ordered Sage Forms

Ordered supplies from Staples

Recreation Committee: attended meeting, created minutes, several conversations with Russ Fall, park work day 9/25/2015 – 17 people attended. Reviewed park work

Deputy Clerk met with supervisor, fire chief and assistant fire chief on October 2, 2015 to discuss fire runs

- Michael Clinesmith 10/12/2015

Supervisors Report Oct. 13 2015

I would like to thank Dan Zuzula for the good job he did on cleaning the front of the Twp. Building.

Also thank the volunteers who came to work on the Twp. Park

In regards to the treasures report in Sept. 8 minutes as to when Twp. Board raises should appear in the paychecks .The Twp . attorney stated the pay raises should start in the new Budget .Also the MTA. Stated the same thing Michaels argument is its illegal to pay employees or officials in advance of completion of their duties .I would like to see the law he is quoting . and my argument is the board of trustees are salary and can receive pay weather they work or not.

Also

Again I must set the record straight on confusing statements being put in the minutes. In the Sept. 8 minutes Onna Clinesmith asked why Dave Kennard our yard maintenance vendor received a 50% wage increase. That statement again is misleading to the public making it sound like a gigantic raise which is false. The truth of the matter is we gave Dave Kennard a \$20.00 raise. That raise is not much considering the cost of fuel & equipment, the quality of work performed, and the fact we greatly increased his work load when we landscaped the premises. He now has to spend a greater amount of time weed whacking around all our landscaped areas. It is my opinion that the(hi percentage comments) are a direct efforts to confuse the residents because the clerk didn't get the raise he was seeking.

I feel along with 3 other members of the board that this token raise is justified based on performance.

It is my opinion the confusion being created by the clerk and family member is a direct violation of Twp. Policy no retaliation and appropriate conduct.

No Retaliation

The township will not tolerate retaliation against any employee, board member or volunteer who in good faith reports a violation or perceived violation of this policy, or retaliation against anyone who participates in any investigation as a witness or otherwise. Retaliation is a serious violation of this policy and is subject to the investigation and corrective measures described in this policy. Any acts of retaliation must be promptly reported to the township supervisor.

Good Faith Rule

The township takes all reports of harassment seriously, and will investigate all alleged violations of this policy. Therefore, employees are expected to bring violations to the township's attention in good faith. Good faith means that the person has a sincerely held belief, even if erroneous, that the policy has been violated.

Appropriate Conduct

Employees, board members and volunteers are expected to accept certain responsibilities, adhere to acceptable business principles and manners of personal conduct, and exhibit a high degree of personal integrity at all times. This not only involves sincere respect for the rights and feelings of others but also demands that both in your business and your personal life, you refrain from any behavior that might be harmful to you, your co-workers and / or Vassar Township, or that might be viewed unfavorably by the public at large.